The Future of Animal Welfare
A look back, around and forward

Roger Haston, Ph.D.
CAO
A Cattle Dog’s Dilemma
Realistic Optimism

AN OPTIMIST, A PESSIMIST & AN OPTOMETRIST

THE GLASS IS HALF FULL!

THE GLASS IS HALF EMPTY.

UH, GUYS...
The World is Complex
A Brief History of Animal Welfare
The Beginning

Cruelty, Abuse & Suffering

Henry Bergh
The First SPCA’s

- ASPCA, 1866
- Erie County, 1867
- San Francisco, 1868
- Massachusetts, 1868
- Pennsylvania, 1868
Dear Friends:

ANIMALDOM


Subscription to others than members and donors, 25 cents a year to cover postage. Notify promptly change of address.

Ambulances and Agents
Call Ste 4700, Park 4723 for removal of sick or injured animals and investigation of complaints. Twenty-four hour service.

Free Clinic
Open every work day, except holidays, 10 A.M. to Noon. Dr. George H. Kinelmon, Chief Veterinarian, Dr. T. Upton Cleary, Assistant Veterinarian.

Annual Membership $5.00. Life Membership $50.00.

What We Did in November

Prosecutions .......................... 3
Horses ordered from labor ............. 17
Harness adjustments .................. 2
Coops of poultry relieved from over-crowding ......................... 18
Animals ordered humanely destroyed 9
Assistance and advice rendered ......... 191

Regular Inspections:
Stables (private and livery) .......... 400
Riding Stables ......................... 90
Poultry Dealers ....................... 747
Pet Shops and Kennels ............... 43
Dumps and Piers ...................... 183
Abattoirs ............................. 245
Live Stock Auctions ................... 6
Stock Yards ............................ 32

Inspections and investigations made in 2 Counties outside of Philadelphia .................. 3
Visits to circuses, dog shows, farms, parades, piggeries ....................... 7
Calls for removal of large animals .. 7
Calls for removal of small animals 697
Animals humanely destroyed: (large 1; small, 756) ......................... 757
Animals handled at Shelter .......... 76
Pets placed in homes ................. 28
1964
- Release of Ruth Harrison’s “Animal Machines” book which highlighted the abysmal conditions for agricultural animals in Britain

1965
- UK government commissioned an investigation, led by Professor Roger Brambell, into the welfare of intensively farmed animals
- From this, the Five Freedoms were developed
The Five Freedoms

- Freedom from hunger and thirst
- Freedom from discomfort
- Freedom from pain, injury, and disease
- Freedom to express normal behavior
- Freedom from fear and distress
1970’s: Public Awareness Grows

Hope Shelter
The Ones

Florida, 105-87
- Page 01

Animals Abandon All Hope When Entering Animal Shelter

‘The Dogs We Get in Here Are the Ones Nobody Wants or Will Take Care Of.’

Facing Lonely, Silent Death

Cages aren’t happy homes for dogs and this rescue is really open in this weather. Some recent numbers are the county dog pound behind the J.C. but his friends could be at the University of Florida working on his behalf. He would never be sent a cage like this to be used for research experiments.
The Humane Movement Grows

- First low cost spay and neuter clinics opened
  - 1969 in Los Angeles was the first

- Focus on euthanasia methodology
  - Elimination of cruel and painful methods begin

- Involvement of veterinary community
  - Importance of disease control and animal condition recognized

- Growth of adoptions from shelters
  - Humane organizations begin promoting the rescuing of animals from shelters
Early Pioneers

- Donald Anthony, Humane Society of Missouri, St Louis
- Martha Armstrong, Massachusetts SPCA & HSUS
- James Bandow, Animal Control Services, Toronto
- Eric Blow, Jefferson County Animal Shelter, Louisville, KY
- Michael Burgwin, Seattle Animal Control, WA
- Pam Burney, City of North Richland Hills, TX
- Pam Burns, Hawaiian Humane Society, Honolulu
- Harry Dates, Hamilton County SPCA, Cincinnati
- William Garrett, Atlanta Humane Society, GA
- Dr. John Kullberg, American SPCA, NY
- Fred Lee, San Diego Humane Society, CA
- Carter Luke, Massachusetts SPCA
- Jan McHugh-Smith, Boulder, San Francisco, Colorado Springs
- Phillis Wright, HSUS

- Dennis Moore, Animal Care and Control Division Palm Beach County, FL
- Julie Morris, Michigan Humane Society & ASPCA
- Bob Rush, City of LA Animal Control, CA
- Bob Sheen, Arizona Humane Society
- Art Slade, Animal Rescue League, Boston
- John Snyder, Alachua County Office of Animal Control, FL
- Gary Tiscornia, Michigan Humane Society, Auburn Mills
- Laura Thompson, Honolulu, HI
- Ruth “Alex” Wade, Hawaiian Humane Society, Honolulu
- Jeanne Werner, Tacoma-Pierce Co Humane Society, WA
- Dennis White, American Humane Association, Denver
- Phillis Wright, HSUS
1990’s: Focus on Live Outcomes

- First appearance of the “no kill” movement
- Large well funded shelters developed
- Growth of low cost spay neuter begin to impact intake
- Public awareness around the value of adoption grew
In 2004, a group was convened in Asilomar to:

- Build a bridge across varying philosophies
- Develop relationships and create goals focused on significantly reducing the euthanasia of healthy and treatable companion animals

Developed some guiding principles and a common metric for success.

- Live Release Rate

A push for metrics and transparency
Before 1986, only four states had felony animal cruelty laws: Massachusetts (1804), Oklahoma (1887), Rhode Island (1896) and Michigan (1931).

Three states enacted felony laws in the 1980s, 19 in the 1990s and 25 more since 2000 (including the District of Columbia).

50 states currently include felony provisions in their animal cruelty laws.
Changing Attitudes Toward Pets

From the back yard to the bedroom
Growth of Animal Rights
Animal Welfare (Peter Singer -- Consequentialism)

- Concerned with choosing the action that will bring about the greatest good for the greatest number of individuals.
- Prevention of unnecessary suffering
- Ensure a good quality of life and humane death.

Animal Rights (Tom Reagan, Gary Francione -- Kantian Theories)

- Assumes all subjects-of-a life possess inherent value and must be treated as ends-in-themselves, never as a means to an end
- A right may not be sacrificed even if the consequences of doing so are appealing or negative.
2010’s Rising Conflict and Confusion

Living With The Failure Of No Kill

Casualties of the “save rate”: 40,000 animals at failed no-kill shelters & rescues

Limited Admission
Animal Welfare Metrics

A Quick Review
Why Do We Measure?

- Assess the current state
- Track progress toward success
- Create awareness and focus
- Keep us grounded
- Keep us aligned to our mission
- Motivate our donors & constituents
Risks In Metrics

- Measuring the Wrong Thing
- Drawing the Wrong Conclusion
- Destructive Incentives
- Myopia
Sheltering Has Been Focused On

- Responding to a problem: Overpopulation

- Tools we have been using:
  - Spay/Neuter
  - Sheltering
  - Adoption

- The scope of the problem forced us into a reactive strategy
Traditional Measurements

- Live Release Rate
- Intake
- Euthanasia
- Adoptions
- Lives Saved

Most of our measurements have been shelter-centric and organizationally focused.

We have migrated away from overpopulation focus and onto a euthanasia focus.
Tremendous Progress

Source: July/Aug 2008 Animal People
The Rise and Fall of Live Release Rate
Live Release Rate Limitations

- Only looks at one aspect of animal welfare
- Loses all information about scale
- Achieving a high live release rate is not necessarily a measure of a successful operation
- It is highly dependent on the input population
Impact of LLR on Shelter Outcomes

* Mean over 100 realizations
Impact of Limiting Admission

**Open Admission Shelter**
**Policy: Only Euthanize Class 6**

**Limited Admission Shelter**
**Policy: No Euthanasia**

Increasing intake restrictions
It's a Community Problem

- Open
- Limited
A Growing Inventory Problem?

We are running out of dogs that people want...........but not everywhere
Intake is Declining

Regional animal shelters decline

NPR: “Are We Running Out of Rescue Dogs?”

Bob Pendergrass: Animal welfare is improving in Rowan

Empty cages: Where have all of Anchorage's shelter pets gone?
Why the Decline?

- Years of Spay/Neuter efforts are finally impacting population
- More public awareness about pet overpopulation
- Different approach to cats being deployed; many municipalities no longer pick up cats
- Public fear of shelters
- Shelters are not reaching the need
- Shelters are limiting admission
The Explosion of Transfers

778,385 dogs

From Woodruff & Smith, 2017
Transfer at a Large Scale

Percent of Dogs Adopted in Colorado that Came from Out of State

Year: 2008 to 2015
Highly Adoptable Gets Transferred

- Public
- Coalition
- Outside

Graph showing the distribution of adoptable pets across different categories.
## A Stark Comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Org 1</th>
<th>Org 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Dog Intakes</td>
<td>4388</td>
<td>1494</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puppy Intakes</td>
<td>1153</td>
<td>1482</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intakes from Community</td>
<td>2812</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% operating revenue from transfers</td>
<td>≈ 15%</td>
<td>≈ 95%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Services provided

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Org 1</th>
<th>Org 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Owner surrenders</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requires S/N</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical services</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavior capabilities</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community programs</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advocacy programs</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court &amp; Cruelty</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Dog-o-nomics

- $25 to $50 at Source
- $300 to $450 at Destination
- 40,000 in Colorado in 2016

\[(400 - 50) \times 40,000 = 14,000,000\]

This amount of money can attract some bad actors and create problems in both the source and destination communities if not managed holistically.
Rescue or Hoarder?

The rescue world is largely unregulated and has exploded in number.
How People Adopt is Changing

There is strong competition for adoptable animals
Animal Welfare Organizations

PetSmart Charities
AWOs
Growth of Retail Adoptions

Over 1,000,000 in 2016

This is changing the dynamics of the sheltering community
Blocky Headed Whatevers
The System is Bypassing Large Segments

We are very successful with the people that we are very successful with
Socio-Economic Distribution

Animal Incident Reports from Dallas
Pets-For-Life Data

No Vet Experience vs. No Shelter of AC Contact

- No Vet Experience: 80%
- No Shelter of AC Contact: 100%

Chart shows a higher percentage for No Shelter of AC Contact compared to No Vet Experience.
Where People Get Their Pets

- APPA
- Pets ForLife

- Underserved

- Petstore
- Rescue/Shelter
- Breeder
- Offspring
- Friend/Relative
- Stray
Strong Socio-Economic Variability
Spay/Neuter Rates

- Less than $35k Income:
  - Altered: 51%
  - Unaltered: 49%

- More than $35k Income:
  - Altered: 93%
  - Unaltered: 7%
Why Free is Too Expensive

I need time off work for my cat

4 hrs * $15/hr = $60

How do I catch this thing?

Cat carrier $20

Can I borrow your car?

Uber $20

$50 to $100
Leaving Behind Rural America

- Good quality shelter
- Needs improvements in a few areas
- Needs improvements in many areas
The Current Model is not Financially Viable

For most organizations… others will thrive
Skyrocketing Cost of Sheltering

Increase in Expenses since 2000 (Inflation Adjusted)

- Average of all shelters
The Cost of Doing More

Per animal

$0

$250

$500

$750

$1,000

1999  2001  2003  2005  2007  2009  2011  2013

total expenditures per animal

total program services per animal

total veterinary services per animal
Cost in Non-Profit Shelters

Cost per Animal vs. Number of Animal Intakes
Municipal Spending Disparity

Per head count based on population and the average budget from the last three years

SOURCE: Dallas Morning News
Scope of the Problem

$10,000,000,000,000

per year

(if nothing changes)
Attitude Polarization

The Growing Divide
Following a general trend in our society, animal welfare is polarizing and getting more extreme.
Are We In an Echo Chamber?

Jonny opened the door to the one place he always heard the truth.
A Growing Disconnect?
A Loss of Perspective

- “Memphis -- Director Receives Death Threats”
- “Bomb, death threats beset Lindon animal Shelter”
- “Clarksville crying dog video, petition spur death threats”
- “Augusta animal director receives death threats over euthanasia”
Real People

Jace Valdez
Howard Nicholson, Jr.
Diane Jansen
Dylan Andres
Kylar Johnson
James Hurst
Aiden McGrew
Jeremiah Eskew-Shahan
Clifford Wright
Jazlyn Mesa
Makayla Damell
Eugene Cameron
Ja'Marr Tiller
Jack Redin
Tyzhel McWilliams
Ronnel Brown
Rebecca Carey
Charles Hagerman
Dawn Jurgens
Bryton Cason
Debra Renee Wilson-Roberts
James Hudson
Donald Thomas
Rayden Bruce
Nellie Davis
Mary Jo Hunt
Tarilyn Bowles
Dixie Jennings
Remedios Romeros-Solares
Dawn Brown
Esteban Alavez
Unknown woman
Savannah Edwards
Tomas Henio
Betty Ann Chapman Todd
Christian Gormanous
Elsie Grace
Isaiah Aguilar
Ryan Maxwell
Daxton Borchardt
Monica Renee Laminack
Tyler Jett
Claudia Gallardo
Jordyn Arndt
Beau Rutledge
Rachael Honabarger
Carlton Freeman
Pamela Marie Devitt
Ayden Evans
Nephi Selu
Arianna Jolee Merrbach
Linda Oliver
Jordan Reed
Daniel Teubner
Samuel Eli Zamudio
Jordan Ryan
Terry Douglass
Katherine Atkins
Nga Woodhead
Levi Watson
Joan Kappen
Jah’Niyah White
Mia Gibson
Michal Nelson
Betty Clark
Tom J. Vick
Christine Bell
Kara Hartrich
Annabell Martin
Klonda S. Richey
Je’vaeh Mayes
Braelynn Rayne Coulter
Summer Sears
Kenneth Santilla
Raymane Robinson Jr.
Mia DeRouen
Dorothy Hamilton
John Harvard
Katie Morrison
Jessica Norman
Kasli Haith
Holden Garrison
Craig Sytsma
Logan Shepard
Johnathan Quarles Jr.
Cindy Whisman
Joel Chirieleison
Deriah Solem
Javon Dade Jr.
David Glass Sr
Alice Payne
Logan Meyer
Alameaner Dial
Jose Cruz Cazes Robles
Deanne Lynn Coando
Stella Antanaitis
Jayla Rodriguez
Edward Cahill
Christopher Joaquin Camejo
Eugene Smith
Declan Moss
Malaki Mildward
Fredrick Crutchfield
TayLynn DeVaughn
Roy Higgenbotham Jr.
Betty Wood
Julia Charging Whirlwind
DeTrick Johnson
Neta Lee AdamsKenneth Ford
Brayden Wilson
Gage Ramirez
James Nevils III
Jordan Collins-Tyson
Norberto Legarda
Joshua Strother
Annie Williams
Carolyn Lamp
Max Gracia
Porsche Cartee
Cathy H. Wheatcraft
Barbara McCormick
Emilio Rios
Carmen Reigada
Lamarkus Hicks
Tanner Smith
Edgar Brown
Amiyah Dunston
Anthony Riggs
Carter Hartle
Xavier Strickland
Rebecca Hardy
Nyjah Espinosa
Tyler Trammell-Huston
Payton Sawyers
Talan West
Aiden Grim
Suzanne Story
Bessie Flowers
Sonda Tyson
Sebastian Caban
Adonis Reddick
Earl Wayne Stephens Jr.
Hunter Bragg
Erin McCleskey
Jocelyn Winfrey
Susie Kirby
Christopher Malone
Divergent Whys

We haven’t come to grips that we aren’t all working for the same thing

- Right to Life
- Humane Treatment
- Promote Pet Ownership
- Eliminate Breeding
- Eliminate Suffering
- Reduce Population
- No More Homeless Pets
- Celebrate the Human Animal Bond
Looking Outside Our World

Where can we look to understand the future?
Addressing a Problem

- Education
- Early Interdiction
- Strict and Severe Enforcement
  - Up to $10,000 fine for aggressive dog attack
  - Potential court ordered euthanasia

How Calgary reduced dog attacks without banning pit bulls

RENÉ BRUERMER, MONTREAL GAZETTE
More from René Bruemer, Montreal Gazette
The Future of Animal Welfare

Pets, people, preserving the bond, professionalization and a whole new set of metrics
Forward to Our Roots

- We started around eliminating cruelty and suffering and reducing pet homelessness

- Adoption and life saving are tactics, not ends

- It's about being humane; it's the currency that brings us together

- Building and maintaining the bond is key
Honest Risk Assessment

- We have no formal risk assessment methodology
- Community data on public safety issues is sparse and often flawed
- Every time a person has a negative experience with an animal, it sets us back
- We have to come to grips and be honest about the consequence of aggression

Our relationship with animals has been built up over 50,000 years. We can not afford to risk jeopardizing that bond for short-term benefit.
Focusing on the Welfare Deserts

No Car and No Supermarket Store Within a Mile

SOURCE: Department of Agriculture, Centers for Disease Control
Rebuilding Our Metrics

Community Impact Assessment

- Highest Community Impact
- Good Community Impact

Out of State Transfer %

Communit Intake:
- <200
- 5000
- 10000
- 15000
- 17639

Community Adoptions:
0 - 7,000

Adopted
12K
10K
8K
6K
4K
2K
0K
Refocus on Maintaining the Bond

Source: California Department of Public Health
Too Many Organizations

- San Diego
- Washington
- Minneapolis
- .................

- Like in the Arts, our space needs to consolidate in order to better serve those who need it
Professionalization

- We risk marginalizing ourselves in society
- We need professional certifications and qualifications
- Passion is not enough
- We serve people and pets, not just pets
Cats: One Big Complex ......???

- We need to deal with all the cats in the community beyond just having cats in the community
- The new approaches to cats have rendered traditional measurements like “intake” woefully insufficient
- No agreed upon goal or measure of success
- A mash-up of interests – it’s bigger than the cats
Many of the messages that have made us successful are starting to get in our way

- Animals should only be adopted
- “Adoptable”
- Save them All
- No Kill
- Everyone Should Have a Pet
- Donate to save this poor sad creature locked away in a dirty, dank, stinky shelter where no one cares (backed by sad music)
- People want to kill adoptable pets
Where We Can Be

Celebrating the human animal bond
No more homeless pets
Safe
Pet-friendly
Compassionate to people and animals
Community engaged
A Cattle Dog’s Dilemma
Thank you for listening!

Questions?
Early Pioneers

- Donald Anthony
- Martha Armstrong
- James Bandow
- Eric Blow, Jefferson County Animal Shelter, Louisville, KY
- Michael Burgwin, Seattle Animal Control, WA
- Pam Burney, City of North Richland Hills, TX
- Pam Burns, Hawaiian Humane Society, Honolulu
- Harry Dates, Hamilton County SPCA, Cincinnati
- William Garrett, Atlanta Humane Society, GA
- Dr. John Kullberg, American SPCA, NY
- Fred Lee, San Diego Humane Society, CA
- Carter Luke, Massachusetts SPCA
- Jan McHugh-Smith, Boulder, San Francisco, Colorado Springs
- Phillis Wright, HSUS

- Dennis Moore, Animal Care and Control Division Palm Beach County, FL
- Julie Morris, Michigan Humane Society & ASPCA
- Bob Rush, City of LA Animal Control, CA
- Bob Sheen, Arizona Humane Society
- Art Slade, Animal Rescue League, Boston
- John Snyder, Alachua County Office of Animal Control, FL
- Gary Tiscornia, Michigan Humane Society, Auburn Mills
- Laura Thompson, Honolulu, HI
- Ruth “Alex” Wade, Hawaiian Humane Society, Honolulu
- Jeanne Werner, Tacoma-Pierce Co Humane Society, WA
- Dennis White, American Humane Association, Denver
- Phillis Wright, HSUS